

A Comparative Study on the Internationalized School-Running Mode of Higher Education from the Perspective of Globalization—Taking China and Qatar as Examples

Wang Zexi^{1,a,#}, Zhang Liting^{2,b,#}, Pu Jiao^{2,c,*}

¹School of Graduate Studies, Lingnan University City, Hong Kong, SAR, China

²Feng Jicai Institute of Literature and Art, Tianjin University, Tianjin, China

^aWang2022zexi@163.com, ^b1370594853@qq.com, ^c80890894@qq.com

[#]Co-first author

^{*}Corresponding author

Keywords: Internationalization of Higher Education, Sino-foreign Cooperation in Running Institutions, Invitation system for Running Institutions, China, Qatar

Abstract: A well-known development trend is the internationalization of higher education, which is fundamentally a process of cross-cultural interaction and the negotiation of shared meaning based on equality and respect. The struggle for talent is intensifying the competition of the entire national strength. International cooperation in higher education has emerged as a key tactic for nations looking to develop interdisciplinary talent with a keen sense of global awareness, familiarity with international economic concepts and norms. Western developed nations still hold the hegemonic position in global competition and are at the forefront of the internationalization of higher education as a result of the early development of this field. The movement of top-notch educational resources from developed countries to developing nations, however, is the core of the contemporary globalization of education. With the rise of developing nations in recent years, China and Qatar have established two development models—Sino-foreign cooperative education and invitation-based education—that have become internationally recognized successes in the internationalization of higher education. To serve as a reference for the growth of higher education internationalization in developing nations, this article chooses two cases, China and Qatar, for an in-depth comparison.

1. Introduction

Higher education will inevitably become more global, and knowledge and understanding advancement is a truly multinational endeavor. Higher education institutions can assist students and staff in preparing for the international context through internationalization, and they are also responsible for establishing the internal knowledge of the nation through teaching and research. At the same time, internationalization can help avoid the narrowness of academics and research and emphasize interdisciplinary research. Fresh insight and comprehension of how nations' and countries' relationships are changing. The "Pilgrimage" of European intellectuals who brought new

ideas, fresh perspectives, and new objects from other countries may be traced back to the establishment and beginning of higher education, from the Middle Ages to the Renaissance. From the 18th century to the First World War, the direction of internationalization of education was the export of higher education systems to newly independent countries. The extent of international academic interactions grew after World War II, and American and Soviet forms of higher education, which were influenced by European ideas, predominated.[1]. A favorable environment for the internationalization of higher education was created at the end of the 20th century, which allowed developing nations to expand, decolonize, and gradually move from the "Margin" to the "Centre" of higher education development.

The internationalization of higher education is manifested in various ways, mainly in the form of mobility, specifically domestic mobility and foreign mobility. The characteristics of mobility lead to the development of new educational models, including franchising, branch campuses, etc., which progressively give rise to international education. Transnational schooling varies from traditional education in that it emphasizes more policy-oriented and specialized educational activities as well as international cooperation. As a result, they place a greater emphasis on orientation, original goal, and talent cultivation than does traditional higher education.

Through the examination of internationalization models in China and Qatar, this essay analyses the current state and factors contributing to the success of internationalized higher education in emerging nations. For the advancement of higher education in other developing nations, it offers learning opportunities and lessons. Additionally, it offers a vision for how higher education would expand internationally in emerging nations.

2. Methodology

Many nations have started building cooperative educational institutions in the context of the internationalization of higher education. China and Qatar are good examples of improving higher education and serve as role models for developing nations. To identify similarities and differences between the success of higher education internationalization in China and Qatar, this paper decides to conduct a comparative analysis of the higher education internationalization models of China and Qatar based on the perspective of globalization and integration. Conclusions are derived from the similarities and contrasts to offer guidance for the internationalization of higher education in underdeveloped nations.

Table 1: A Comparison of Internationalized Higher Education Provision in China and Qatar.

| | China | Qatar |
|-----------------------------|--|---|
| Educational Policies | Long history, large number of institutions | Short time, high development, sufficient funds |
| Educational Model | Cooperation but not joint venture | Invitation system |
| Education Management | Complex structure, with both private and public business models, and low overall standards of private institutions | Mostly private model, advanced teaching resources |

First, through descriptive analysis, this study briefly analyses the history of Sino-foreign cooperative education institutions and international cooperative education branches in Qatar. Different national ideologies have an impact on how the internationalization of education develops and how internationalized school institutions seem. This analytical technique aids in understanding the goals and objectives of educational progress across the world. Second, using case studies, this essay examines the operating procedures of Sino-foreign cooperative education institutions and

international cooperative education branches in Qatar and discusses the benefits and drawbacks of doing so. Finally, the analysis presented above leads to the study's conclusions and offers recommendations for future internationalized higher education growth (Table 1).

3. A Comparison of the Background of Sino-foreign Cooperative Education and Qatar's Invitational System of Schooling

The social backdrop of a nation has a significant impact on the development of education, and the needs for educational development vary depending on the nation's nature and its many national development objectives.

China is home to 1.4 billion people and covers 9,597,000 square kilometres of territory. China will have a GDP of 121 trillion CNY in 2022, making it one of the world's fastest-expanding economies and the largest exporter and second-largest importer in the world. [2].

Since 1971, Qatar has been a sovereign and independent nation. Qatar is one of the richest nations in the world due to its geographic location and its abundant natural gas and oil resources. The population of Qatar was 2.7 million people in 2022, according to the Qatar Statistical Administration. [3]. Qatar significantly depends on foreign labour.

The following sections will compare the international education policies and institutions of China and Qatar based on the social backgrounds of the two nations to highlight the background factors that contribute to the success of Sino-foreign cooperative education and Qatar's invitation-based educational system.

3.1. Education Policy

The broad governmental policy on the requirements for the advancement of education over a specific period by the demands of social development is known as education policy. The framework of education and educational development are influenced by education policy, which has a binding and guiding influence. An education policy that does not adapt to social growth has a detrimental effect on educational development by disrupting and limiting it.

3.1.1. Education Policy of Sino-foreign Cooperative Education

Sino-foreign cooperative education has a long history, from its infancy to its development, and is currently in a mature stage of development, in contrast to the internationalized branch campuses in Qatar. China has implemented several policies and legislation on the internationalization of higher education in response to China's entrance to the WTO, which indicates that its future development will be global, to foster global collaboration and exchange. In 2003, China introduced the Regulations on School Operation, the first Chinese law and regulation on Chinese foreign school operation, which put forward specific requirements and practices on the nature, code of conduct, scope, application process, and quality of Chinese foreign school operation. For instance, it is suggested that Chinese-foreign cooperative education institutions regularly inform society of the types and levels of school operation, professional settings, course contents, and enrollment scale, among other things. Chinese-foreign cooperative higher education institutions, in contrast to Qatar's education management policy, are expected to be cooperative; joint ventures, as well as foreign educational institutions, other organizations, or individuals, are not permitted to run schools alone. The State Council's educational administrative department must approve the establishment of institutions of higher education and above, while the people's government of the province, autonomous region, or municipality directly under the Central Government must approve the establishment of Chinese-foreign cooperative institutions of higher specialized education and non-

academic higher education. In other words, the policy of Chinese-foreign cooperative education is led by the government, which conducts guidance and formulates specific measures. In the same way as Qatar, the state has financial support for cooperative institutions, but the support is limited, so preferential policies have been introduced to benefit Sino-foreign cooperative institutions. [4].

The future of the entire nation is on the line in higher education, which is also where culture is developed and shared. The fundamental tenet for China to develop international cooperation in higher education is to fully uphold the sovereignty of Chinese education, to strengthen education for China's excellent traditional culture throughout the educational process, to foster students' patriotism from culture, and at the same time to absorb foreign beneficial experience in the development of international higher education to strengthen China's higher education. [5].

3.1.2. Qatar's Education Policy on Internationalization

Most of the modern universities in the Middle East were built late and with a weak foundation due to their homogeneous economic structure and strong foreign dependence, while the university structure at that time could not contribute to economic and social development. Qatar has, however, fully capitalized on its advantages to make up for its shortcomings. The Education City is also known as an "Academic Oasis" because it concentrates on universities. It has attracted 11 prestigious universities in around ten years, and its universities have an average international rating that is far greater than that of nations in the same region. In the 21st century, countries in the Middle East have released their national blueprints, including Qatar and Saudi Arabia, which have placed education as one of their main development goals. To achieve the goal of world-class education, education is carried out on three main levels: first, the K-12 education system, second, the reform of Qatar's universities, and third, the establishment of Qatar Education City for education, science, and community development.[6]. Qatar has introduced higher education institutions and created international campuses, using mainly Western (mainly American) teaching models.

Qatar has implemented educational changes since 2001 with a focus on internationalization, raising the standard of instruction, and expanding students' opportunities to take part in societal advancement. This section focuses on the development and reform of educational policy management, educational expenditure, educational principles, and language in Qatari higher education institutions to reflect Qatar's internationalized campuses' educational policies. First, Qatar established the Supreme Education Council at the outset of the educational reform, a body tasked with developing new educational policies and goals, drafting agreements with independent institutions, developing curriculum guidelines, and providing monetary and professional support for Qatar's four core programs, namely Arabic, English, Mathematics, and Science. [7]. For university institutions to attain the necessary independent autonomy, this reform aims to achieve governmental autonomy and administrative decentralization. Second, fiscal policy in education has an impact on how well a nation's educational system develops, thus the proportion of expenditure on education is a byproduct of a nation's policy slant. After Saudi Arabia, Qatar spends the most money on higher education in the Gulf. Qatar's spending on education climbed from US\$460 million in 2001 to US\$ nearly \$7 billion in 2014. In support of more than 130 collaborations with foreign universities, the Qatar National Research Foundation invests over 780 million US dollars per year. [8]. The Education Centre also receives support from the Qatar Foundation (QF), a private nonprofit organization. QF provides the resources, dedication, and leadership necessary to ensure the success of each program element at the Education Centre. Qatar invests much more in education than other wealthy nations, according to a 2019 World Bank assessment of statistics.[9]. Third, Qatar's internationalization strategy is founded on the diversity concept and aims to strike a balance between national cultural identity and alien and foreign ideological ideals. Higher levels of cultural inclusivity in Qatar are necessary due to the distinctive educational system offered at its

internationally oriented universities. Qatar's education policy prioritizes national culture while audaciously drawing on the lessons of prosperous developed nations. [10].

3.2. Comparative Analysis of Chinese and Qatar Higher Education Institutions

Higher education institutions are the physical manifestation of educational development, and the analysis of the organization of higher education institutions allows us to draw similarities and differences between the development of Chinese and foreign cooperative higher education institutions and international higher education institutions in Qatar and also facilitates the analysis of the strengths and weaknesses of higher education institutions in both countries, as well as a good way to analyse the reasons for the success of higher education in China and Qatar.

3.2.1. Sino-foreign Cooperative Higher Education Institutions

Enrolment in higher education in China is rising as a result of the country's ongoing growth of its higher education system, which has prompted the creation of increasingly prestigious higher education institutions. Chinese foreign cooperative management universities have emerged as a result of higher education's globalization and internationalization. The Sino-foreign Cooperative University Alliance (S9) is composed of nine universities in China with independent legal personalities, including New York University in Shanghai, Nottingham University in Ningbo, Liverpool University in West China, Cane University in Wenzhou, Duke University in Kunshan, and Northern Polytechnic University in Shenzhen. Chinese-foreign cooperative schools have a more complex organizational structure than Qatari counterparts, and they can be further separated into public and private institutions. Private Chinese-foreign cooperative schools have a small student body and a poor overall standard, indicating room for growth. [11]. The Chinese government also provides programs for cooperation education between Chinese and foreigners. This program, one of the key forms of Chinese-foreign cooperative education, directly carries out substantive collaboration in a particular discipline, major, or program, as opposed to building a particular educational institution. As an illustration, Tsinghua University and Johns Hopkins University work together to provide a Ph.D. in public health program that aims to enhance the management abilities and leadership potential of professionals in the healthcare industry. Contrarily, in Qatar, Sino-foreign cooperative education contains aspects of Chinese thought as opposed to mimicking the Western teaching strategies used at prestigious universities. At the University of Nottingham Ningbo in China, study topics include modern Chinese issues and sustainable technology (Nottingham) research. [12].

The majority of the co-programs are transnational, which simply means "not studying abroad," in contrast to the international universities in Qatar. In their home country of residence, students take courses from higher education institutions in other nations.[13].

3.2.2. International Higher Education Institutions in Qatar

With the development of the knowledge economy, individual countries are striving to build world-class university programs, and the global knowledge economy has made higher education and research an important player in the economy. The goal of internationalizing higher education is to promote greater cross-cultural understanding through exchange and collaboration.[13]. Qatar's unique social structure has also had a significant impact on the development of its global education system. The Qatari government emphasizes the importance of social, economic, environmental, and human development as the four pillars for achieving the national vision. According to the national vision, natural resources will eventually be depleted and therefore, education must be strongly promoted for sustainable human development in a knowledge-based, competitive world.[14].

Therefore, Qatar has partnered with top-notch education systems to support the country's educational development. According to the study, the United Arab Emirates, with 40 international campuses, dominates the field and accounts for a quarter of all such universities worldwide.[15]. Currently, Qatar has 11 international affiliates, which helps the country to develop its talent as well as attract outside talent. Carnegie Mellon University Qatar, for example, enrolls more than 400 students from 60 different countries in undergraduate programs in biological sciences, business administration, computer science, and information systems. The goal of the Qatar International Campus is to attract foreign talent and help them develop locally after graduation to create a regional talent center and ensure the continued development of Qatar.[16].

Qatar's international higher education institutions fall under the category of international cooperation, which is a collaboration of higher education activities with institutions in other countries, for both local and overseas students, and is organized in three forms, virtual, physical, and virtual and physical crossover.[17].

4. Analysis of the Internationalization Model between China and Qatar

4.1. The Sino-Foreign Cooperative Education Model

(1) Development History: Since the reform and opening up forty years ago, Sino-foreign cooperative schools have been built from the ground up, point by point, and the school team has gradually grown. China has developed three fundamental cooperative schooling approaches in recent years: the integration model, the grafting model, and the loose model. Currently, Sino-foreign cooperative schooling projects are typically established in Chinese partner institutions, with the Chinese side in charge of enrolment and both Chinese and foreign parties jointly in charge of formulating talent training objectives and teaching plans. This has created a better foundation for international cooperation.

(2) Supervision and Coverage: In recent years, the Chinese government has implemented full supervision of the legal compliance of foreign partner institutions, primarily through the platform of a foreign-related supervision network and certificate recognition platform, evaluation mechanism, and punishment mechanism to realize the supervision of the quality and effectiveness of Chinese-foreign cooperative education. The majority of the current forms of Chinese-foreign cooperative education do not have independent legal personalities of Chinese-foreign cooperative education institutions, are typically second-level colleges, and are primarily managed directly by domestic cooperative universities.[18]. Since the China Scholarship Council (CSC) was founded in 1996, it has encouraged talented individuals from Chinese universities, scientific research institutions, and related units to travel abroad for further study through scholarship funding programs.

(3) Management Mode: In terms of curriculum, instructional techniques, and management, Chinese and foreign cooperative universities maintain a high level of comparability with overseas cooperative institutions. The "Original Introduction" of the cooperative units makes up the majority of the instructional materials currently used in Sino-foreign cooperative universities. The main component of the educational resources offered by Sino-foreign cooperative schools is foreign teachers. The unique characteristics of foreign teachers in Chinese-foreign cooperative schools are primarily manifested in the clear national regulations on their quantity and quality. The institution needs to hire more teachers to get more top-notch teaching resources. The percentage of foreign teachers is also rising as a result of the need for additional top-notch educational resources.[19]. Through the "3+1" or "3+2" model (part of the program is completed at the Chinese institution and the other part is completed at the foreign partner institution). This ensures that local culture is taught and broadens pupils' perspectives on the world. High-caliber foreign talent is developed through the Chinese-foreign cooperative education model, and China accelerates the optimization of its

domestic higher education resources.

4.2. The Qatari Invitation Model

(1) Development History: Through an invitation-only policy, Qatar has quickly internationalized its education, economy, and society in a short amount of time. For instance, the 10-year contract that QF and Virginia Commonwealth University signed in 2012 states that the primary commitment is a "Non-Compete," and that no other school that has started in the city can open another program that confers the same degree in the Middle East. However, the market for higher education in Qatar is not entirely open, and Qatar instead uses an "invitation system" to ensure control over the introduction of educational resources and to train the needs of the country by those needs rather than accepting applications.

(2) Supervision and Coverage: Through the Higher Education Institute, which was formed under the Supreme Education Council, the Supreme Education Council of Qatar monitors and evaluates the quality of branch campuses. With a low entry threshold for national students and a "Provisional Admission" policy that permits national students who have not yet met the admission requirements but are close to the school to follow the same courses as the regular students for a set period, the policy gives national students more rights and increases their access to higher education abroad by allowing students who are close to meeting the admission requirements to enrol in the same courses as regular students for a set amount of time and have their academic records kept regardless of whether they ultimately do. To give national students the best chance of pursuing higher education, the minimum percentage of national students is also determined.

(3) Management Mode: To ensure consistency with the main campus in terms of specialization, teaching, and evaluation, the Qatar Campus offers the same or comparable facilities, resources, and staff hiring standards as the main school. The Qatar campus has enacted a "Parity of Employment" policy, which ensures that faculty and staff hired by the school are integrated into the main campus and are given the same consideration when it comes to hiring and evaluating staff members. [20]. Qatar Campus provides the same or similar educational services as the main campus to ensure its competitiveness.

5. Conclusions

The internationalization of higher education has begun to demonstrate the effects of global educational governance from the nationalized operation of higher education in China and Qatar, i.e., the high-quality education resources of developed countries have landed in developing countries in a variety of ways, making higher education more accessible to more people worldwide.

Sino-foreign cooperative education promotes international exchange channels for students under the main body of Chinese concept elements and introduces teaching resources from developed nations, as opposed to solely copying the Western teaching model used by the world's top universities. The Qatari "Invitation-Only" model enables Qatar to quickly internationalize its higher education, bringing about a new management, discipline, and global education paradigm and making a significant advancement in the collection of resources for higher education from industrialized nations.

Globally, the goal of higher education's internationalization is to advance multiculturalism and win-win collaboration in cross-national interactions. The internationalization of higher education is an unavoidable trend that will encourage student mobility between developed and developing nations, a thriving cross-cultural exchange of academic programs, faculty, and courses, as well as the study of global issues and the incorporation of multicultural and international perspectives into teaching, research, and service management. In April 2017, China and Qatar promoted city

cooperation to explore the establishment of "One Belt, One Road" International Schools (Chongqing and Doha). [21]. The focus of future study should be on developing effective cooperation between China and Qatar.

References

- [1] Knight J., & De Wit H. (1995). *Strategies for internationalisation of higher education: Historical and conceptual perspectives. Strategies for internationalisation of higher education: A comparative study of Australia, Canada, Europe and the United States of America*, 5, 32.
- [2] Knoema. (2022). *China| Data and Statistics*. Knoema. <https://knoema.com/atlas/China>
- [3] Planning and Statistics Authority. (2022, June). *Total Population inside State of Qatar, June 2022*. Planning and Statistics Authority.
- [4] Zhu Aimei. (2017). *Introduction to Higher Vocational Colleges Present Situation and Countermeasure for Chinese - Foreign Cooperation in Running Schools*. *Journal of Hubei Open Vocational College*, 30(06), 7–8.
- [5] Xu P. (2012). *A Study of the Sino-Foreign Cooperation in Higher Education*. Sichuan International Studies University.
- [6] Khoury I. E. (2013). *Unbridled globalization: The transformation of higher education in Qatar*. The Pennsylvania State University.
- [7] He Shan, & Cao H. (2011). *The Successful Experience of Educational Reform in Qatar and Its Enlightenment*. *China Education Innovation Herald*, 32, 5–6.
- [8] Hamdan M., & Mirza C. (2021). *3 A critical insight into the Gulf Higher Education landscape*. *Higher Education in the Gulf: Quality Drivers*.
- [9] Alkubaisi H., & Rasool N. (2020). *Financing Higher Education in Arab Countries: Challenges, Constraints and Solutions*. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 8(8), 38-54.
- [10] Ibnouf A., Dou L., & Knight J. (2013). *The evolution of Qatar as an education hub: Moving to a knowledge-based economy*. In *International education hubs: Student, talent, knowledge-innovation models* (pp. 43-61). Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands.
- [11] Chen B. (2019). *Development of Sino-foreign cooperation in running schools in private colleges and universities*. *The Frontiers of Society, Science, and Technology*, 1(11).
- [12] Feng Y. (2013). *University of Nottingham Ningbo China and Xi'an Jiaotong-Liverpool University: globalization of higher education in China*. *Higher Education*, 65(4), 471-485.
- [13] Shao L. (2009). *Policy Analysis of Sino-Foreign Cooperation in Running Schools*. Yangzhou University.
- [14] De Wit H., & Altbach P. G. (2021). *Internationalization in higher education: global trends and recommendations for its future*. *Policy Reviews in Higher Education*, 5(1), 28-46.
- [15] Al-Tamimi N., Amin A., & Zarrinabadi N. (2023). *Describing Qatar*. In *Qatar's Nation Branding and Soft Power: Exploring the Effects on National Identity and International Stance* (pp. 35-47). Cham: Springer Nature Switzerland.
- [16] Becker R. (2010). *International branch campuses: New trends and directions*. *International Higher Education*, (58).
- [17] Zou X., & Cheng C. (2017). *Regional Education Hubs: Rationales, Models, and Paths—Case Studies of Malaysia, Qatar, and Singapore*. *International and Comparative Education*, 39(11), 3–15.
- [18] Peng Chanjuan. (2021). *Achievements, problems and prospects of cross-border schooling in China: A review of the National Medium and Long-term Education Reform and Development Plan (2010-2020)*. *Journal of Hebei Normal University (Education Science Edition)* (04), 65-72.
- [19] Zhu Yanyan & Zhao Qiangqiang. (2022). *The development path of co-operative education between Chinese and foreign universities and curriculum thinking and government co-education*. *Journal of Henan Normal University (Philosophy and Social Science Edition)* (05), 144-149.
- [20] Qin Guanying & Liu Fangjing. (2019). *The development of cross-border higher education in the Gulf region and the implications for China's education "going out"*. *China Higher Education Research* (08), 39-46.
- [21] Feng Yifan & Zhang Qingqing. (2019). *Report on the measurement of trade facilitation in six economic corridors of the "Belt and Road" (2013-2018)*. *People's Forum-Academic Frontier* (19), 64-91.